

REPORT SUMMARY
**Male Trafficking for the Purpose of Labor Exploitation
(Ukraine, the Republic of Belarus, the Republic of Moldova)**

Author: Natalia Gusak

March, 2016

The research was commissioned by the International Organization for Migration Mission in Ukraine by the financial support of Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs. All the opinions, conclusions or recommendations are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the International Organization for Migration (IOM)

This report was commissioned to explore the situation with trafficking in human beings (THB) and the experience of male victims of THB for the purpose of labour exploitation from Ukraine, the Republic of Belarus, and the Republic of Moldova.

Quality design was used for the study which envisaged conducting desk research and field study. Sampling based on the principles of convenience and accessibility. In total 153 male VoT for the purpose of labor exploitation participated in the interviewing, 8 of which live in the Republic of Molodva, 29 – in the Republic of Belarus (Vitebsk (7), Mohyliov (13) and Homel (9) oblasts) and 116 – in Ukraine (Kharkiv (56), Ternopil (31), Vinnytsia (20) and Sumy (9) oblasts). In addition, during the study there were 19 professionals interviewed working in counteracting human trafficking in government, civic and international organizations. Out of them 8 – from the Republic of Moldova, 8 – from the Republic of Belarus and 3 representatives from Ukraine.

As the qualitative design was envisaged by the study, its outcomes are not representative and thus present only the experience of the respondents interviewed from Ukraine (Kharkiv, Ternopil, Vinnytsia and Sumy Oblasts), the Republic of Belarus (Homel, Mohyliov and Vitebsk Oblasts) and the Republic of Moldova. In addition, only those men participated in the study who received assistance as victims of THB from the IOM Mission in respective country and its partner NGOs. Accordingly, the experience of those who did not apply for assistance to the IOM or partner organizations is not represented in the study.

In addition, it is worth noting that not all the male victims of THB for the purpose of labor exploitation who met the selection criteria were able to participate in the study. The selection of men victims of THB for participation in the study was affected by their place of residence: those men mainly participated in the study who lived in the places where the interviewing was held as well as in the settlements nearby. Moreover, those men who were out of the country for the study period were not interviewed. The latter might have resulted into the situation when part of those who had the experience of re-trafficking was not included into the research sampling.

Key outcomes

Key characteristics of interviewed male victims of THB for the purpose of labor.

The largest age group of respondents was men of 18-35 years (53%); the rest of the respondents are aged between 36 and 67 years (47%). Accordingly, majority of male respondents were people of working age but the age distribution differed depending on the country of origin. Thus in Ukraine these were mainly young men without long experience of work, in Belarus and Moldova – elder men with long experience of employment who lost their job due to a range of reasons.

Absolute majority of victims (71%) lived in the oblast centres (except for Moldova), had their own families and 1-2 children to provide their maintenance.

Education of the respondents from the three countries differed too. In Ukraine absolute majority of respondents received higher or vocational education (96%), in Belarus – vocational one (19 out of 29 respondents), in Moldova – incomplete secondary education (6 out of 8 respondents).

Preconditions for the males to become subjects of THB. The study outcomes evidenced that the core prerequisites for men to become subjects of THB are related, in the first instance, with the local labor market issues which is characterized by the lack of working places and widespread closure of industrial enterprises where a significant part of local population traditionally worked, and this is typical for all the three countries. Another actual issue is significant differentiation of competitive wage level at the local markets towards the Russian labor market, and that urges the men to go for earnings, as there are much higher chances to earn significant amount of money. Traditional preconditions are important too which relate to low remuneration, reduction of work places, and loss of actuality of many professions for a modern labor market.

At the same time, each country has its own specific peculiarities which stimulate the men to search for job. Thus, for the Republic of Moldova it's a seasonal prevalence in agriculture. In the Republic of Belarus it's the practice of use at the enterprises the reduced work week as well as difficulties related to regulation of private entrepreneurship. In Ukraine it's an existing large number of specialists with non-competitive professional education and a significant lack of opportunities for career growth in the specialty obtained.

In terms of personal preconditions, it's an existing amongst significant number of respondents' positive experience of employment in another country, both at the times of Soviet Union and during the recent years, as well as willingness and the need to receive a significant amount of money. An important precondition is an openness of borders and knowledge of the language of the country where the respondents found their job.

Recruitment and transfer. The main source of information on the exploitation related work were relatives, friends and acquaintances (often very superficially). Significant number of respondents found the job via mass media, Internet websites in the first instance. The recruitment ways which are widely spread are the activities of 'illegal labor exchanges' and the recruiters' work at the railway/bus stations.

At the same time, while considering the regional context, in the Republic of Belarus the recruiters 'work' even in public employment services by offering jobs to unemployed (they are not staff members of those organizations). In Ukraine many victims used the services of employment agencies, and in the Republic of Moldova there were cases of engagement into domestic exploitation of men with mental disabilities directly by the police staff who used their vulnerable condition.

Most respondents did not have enough information on potential work, its location, conditions etc and, as a rule, they were not making any attempts to check the work they had by fully trusting and relying in everything on the recruiters.

The main way of transfer identified by the study was transportation of the group of people by minibus rented by the potential employer. Nearly one third of respondents purchased tickets for their own costs and was getting on their own to the place of destination previously agreed with the potential employer. At the place of destination part of the respondents was taken by the representatives of employers and brought to the site. There were cases when the men who arrived to the agreed place had to search for job independently as they were not met and they did not have any costs with them for the return ticket.

The border was crossed in most cases legally with the official mark in the passport. However, in some cases there were no marks in the passport, and, accordingly, on their return the men could not prove their crossing the border.

The experience of male labor exploitation. Most respondents indicated that they were under exploitation only one time (78%), for 14% this was the second time experience, and for 8% - the third time experience. However, this data is relative as often respondents were not telling about any other experience as they did not consider themselves working in the situation of labor exploitation.

The main country of destination for majority of men was Russian Federation (80%). Amongst the other countries there were mentioned Poland, the Republic of Belarus, the Republic of Moldova, Finland, Italy, Czech Republic and Ukraine. In terms of regional differences, all the interviewed respondents in the Republic of Belarus were exploited in the Russian Federation. In the Republic of Moldova there were four cases of internal trafficking identified, three such cases in the Russian Federation and one in Ukraine. For Ukrainians the main country of destination was the Russian Federation, the second place is taken by Poland, and the third place – by the Republic of Belarus; one case of internal trafficking was registered.

More than half of respondents were exploited in construction. Such a situation was typical both for men from Belarus and from Ukraine. One fifth of respondents worked in agriculture and that anticipated work at greenhouses and seasonal gathering vegetables and fruit (Ukraine and Belarus first of all), as well as pasture of sheep (Moldova). Several cases concerned work in the forest sector; there were few cases of exploitation in gas supply facilities in the EU countries.

The respondents were experiencing different types of abuse while being exploited. The most widely spread form of male abuse was an economic one which concerned remuneration of labor (not paying the costs earned or only partial payments for subsistence and return ticket home) or the fact the men were taken items of value

(mobile phones, tablets) away from them. Most of them experienced physical abuse. Psychological abuse was manifested via threats and intimidation. The men themselves did not inform on sexual abuse but in several cases the experts indicated that they had identified its signs across those men who referred for aid.

The duration of exploitation in most cases was between one and three months. The longest period of exploitation was over eight years. Most men worked in dangerous conditions (harmful labor conditions, lack of safety means etc) and had a huge workload (12-16 hour working day without any days off).

The respondents mainly lived at the territory of the site where they worked: unfinished premises, trailers, barracks, greenhouses, basements, garages and storage rooms (barn) etc. Living conditions did not allow meeting basic needs: lack of access to drinking water, no possibility for hot meals, lack of appropriate sanitation conditions etc. This was especially complicated in the cold season of the year. Almost all the respondents indicated that they did not have any access to adequate medical aid when being exploited.

Ending exploitation. In most cases the employers made free the men after execution of the required scope of work; when the permitted term was ended for the stay at the territory of the country without registration for the work permit (three months for the Russian Federation); if the men themselves refused to come to work; because of a sudden worsening of the workers' health condition. The documents which in most cases were taken away by the employers at the beginning of their work were voluntarily returned to respondents. Some respondents ran away from the place of exploitation.

The most frequently the employers were taking the men to the railway or the bus station and were buying the return ticket to home, or just were bringing them to the railway/bus station or to the underground station (Moscow city) and leaving them there. Some men were asking their relatives to send them costs for the return ticket.

On their return home some men were trying to find the recruiters and to bring them to account but it was without any results. None of the respondents indicated his participation in the criminal process.

Assistance and reintegration. The respondents were referred for aid to non-governmental organizations the most frequently. Only four respondents from Ukraine indicated that they had received assistance from the state social services. All the respondents from Ternopil, Vinnytsia and Sumy knew about the opportunities to receive such assistance. The main barriers for referrals to governmental organizations were: lack of information on the types of assistance; discrepancy of services with the real needs of victims; low quality of services; existing previous negative experience of communication with the representatives of governmental organizations related to difficulties in processing and submitting documents; fear of violation of confidentiality.

All the respondents were receiving assistance by the civic organizations to which they referred in 6-12 months on their return home. The main sources of the information on the assistance which they used were relatives and acquaintances who were experiencing labor exploitation along with them.

Most of victims received services via material assistance (food packages, hygiene means etc) and medical services at the IOM Rehabilitation Center for Victims of Trafficking.

In terms of regional differences, in Ukraine men had an opportunity to receive services on diagnostics, treatment and purchase of necessary medicines; in Belarus there were only services on diagnostics accessible, and in Moldova there was diagnostics and in some cases payment for surgery.

For the moment of interviewing most respondents were self-employed and engaged into accidental supplementary earnings ('moonlighting'), and that was the main source of their income. For the moment of interviewing part of the respondents already had the experience of recurring exploitation, every fifth respondent was ready to leave home again if promised employment, however to another (from previous place of exploitation) country or on the condition of official employment.

Conclusions

Male trafficking for the purpose of labor exploitation has recently become more and more relevant to Ukraine, the Republic of Moldova and the Republic of Belarus. However, due to the fact that THB for the purpose of labor and forced labor have a range of common features, in practice it is often impossible to differentiate these crimes. Respectively, amongst the men identified as VoT for the purpose of labour exploitation, there are cases of forced labor too.

Any person of working age might become victim of THB for the purpose of labour exploitation, including those who are looking for the first place of employment and those who have long experience of employment. However, in Ukraine it's more relevant to young men of 18-35 years old without long experience of work, and in Belorussia and Moldova – to elder men who had long experience of employment. The risk of becoming VoT does not depend on the level of education, place of residence or family status of men.

The main preconditions for THB for the purpose of labor exploitation are the issues related to the local labor market (lack of work places and widespread closure of industrial plants, differentiation of wages in local markets, low remuneration, reduction of the number of work places, lost of actuality of many professions for the modern labor market) as well as personal factors (existing positive experience of employment in another country as well as the willingness and/or the need to receive a significant amount of money).

While having existing negative social-economic situation in the countries studied, in order to earn at least some costs for living, men accept doubtful job offers by friends and occasional acquaintances, while not checking the information on employers, and they do not get interested in details of work conditions.

As recruitment and transfer are one of the most important components of THB crime, at this very stage the factors are formed which result into the follow up problems. Often male VoT in fact do not have any information on the recruiter (they only know his name and telephone number) and they are not aware of any connections between

different members of criminal formations which ensure their transfer. Similarly, the consideration should be given to the lack of awareness amongst VoT on their rights, peculiarities of crossing the border, requirements on employment in the country of destination and groundless trust to occasional acquaintances that make them vulnerable to THB.

Another actual need is in informing on the necessity to consider the risks while getting employed abroad, specifically, on the following: do not hand the documents to anyone, to have costs for the return ticket home and to add funds to the mobile phone account, to inform close people on one's own place of stay, contacts of employer and negotiator etc.

Male VoT more often refer to civic organizations than to the governmental ones as they do not have enough information on the types of assistance; they consider that the services by the governmental organizations do not meet their real needs; they indicate low quality of services and existing previous negative experience of communication with the representatives of government organizations related to the difficulties in processing and submitting the documents, as well as they are afraid that the information on their situation will not be confidential.

But for medical services, services on re-qualification and opening one's own business, the actual ones could be the following: legal (the ways of verification of employers/employment agencies; assistance in making contracts; methods of collecting evidence base on labor exploitation); information services (placing the information on dishonest employers at the Internet/ social networking sites; informing on the organizations providing assistance to VoT; informing on risks and coping strategies to address risk situations in which the males being exploited could get into); training behavior skills for risk situations.

Recommendations on prevention of male human trafficking for the purpose of labor exploitation

UKRAINE

For the Ministry of Social Policy of Ukraine

1. To conduct training for the specialists working with the victims of THB in governmental organizations (administrations and Centres for social services for youth) in the regions. The topics for the training should be: 'Ethical principles of work with victims of THB: maintaining confidentiality', 'Status of victims of THB: procedure for obtaining the status, human rights of victims of THB with the confirmed status and unconfirmed one', 'Specific of counseling male abuse survivors', 'Needs assessment for victims of THB', 'Case management of victims of THB'.
2. To create the platform for exchanging experience between the representatives from different regions working in the area of counteracting THB.

For the IOM Mission in Ukraine

1. To develop jointly by lawyers and representatives of public centres for employment the recommendations on inspection of employers/employment agencies.
2. To develop jointly by lawyers and representatives of law enforcement bodies the recommendations on identifying THB crime including the specific criteria of identification and relevant evidence base. To differentiate in the recommendations 'THB for the purpose of labour exploitation' and 'exploitation of labor'.
3. To support development and work of the website with the actual information for those who are searching for job in another country/city. To ensure a possibility at the website for maintaining the forum.
4. To develop information materials 'Signs of labor exploitation', 'How to get safely employed in the Russian Federation', 'How to get safely employed in Poland'. Possible places for disseminating the information materials: civic organizations, visa centres, public centres for employment, border checkpoints, websites and social networking sites.
5. To consider an opportunity for recurrent stay of victims of THB at the IOM medical rehabilitation centre.
6. To identify opportunities for partnership with the banks for the purpose of favorable crediting for business established by victims of THB.

For the Ukrainian Counter-Trafficking Coalition

1. To establish partnership relations and to make agreements with the business companies, social enterprises in the region in order to ensure work placements for the organization clients.

2. To develop recommendations on case management of victims of THB in order to provide complex care and to prevent re-trafficking for the exploitation purposes.
3. To conduct training for the social workers of the member organizations on the following topics: 'Needs assessment of victims of THB', 'Case management of victims of THB'.
4. To conduct training for psychologists of the member organizations on the issue: 'Signs of abuse and the specific of counseling abuse survivors'.
5. To conduct training for lawyers of the member organizations on the issue: 'Employment contract: the specific of signing and possible risks'.
6. To conduct training for male victims of THB on the issue: 'Behavior in risk situations and coping strategies to address them'.
7. To engage victims of THB into the information campaigns for peer informing.

REPUBLIC OF BELARUS

For the IOM Mission in the Republic of Belarus

1. To develop the complex program for medical-social rehabilitation of male victims of THB.
2. To conduct training on counteracting THB for the staff of governmental employment centres.
3. To support development and maintenance of the website with the actual information for those who are searching for job in the Russian Federation.
4. To develop information materials 'How to get safely employed in the Russian Federation', 'What kind of evidence might be that you were in labor exploitation'. Possible places for disseminating the information materials: civic organizations, governmental employment centres, websites and social networking sites.
5. To conduct training for the law enforcement bodies representatives on identification of victims and collecting evidence base in case of THB.

For the civic organizations

1. To establish partnership and to make agreements with the organizations in the region to ensure employment for the organization clients.
2. To develop recommendations on case management of victims of THB to ensure services needed for any specific client and to prevent re-trafficking for the purpose of exploitation.
3. To conduct training for the social workers of organizations on the issues: 'Needs assessment of victims of THB', 'Case management of victims of THB'.
4. To conduct training for psychologists of the organizations on the issue: 'Signs of abuse and the specific of counseling abuse survivors'.

5. To conduct training for lawyers of the organizations on the issue: 'Employment contract: the specific of signing and possible risks'.
6. To conduct training for male victims of THB on the issue: 'Behavior in risk situations and coping strategies to address them'.
7. To engage victims of THB into the information campaigns for peer informing.

THE REPUBLIC OF MOLDOVA

For the IOM Mission in Moldova

1. To develop jointly by lawyers and representatives of law enforcement bodies the recommendations on identifying crime related to THB including the specific criteria of identification and relevant evidence base. To differentiate in the recommendations 'THB for the purpose of labour exploitation' and 'exploitation of labor'.
2. To support development and maintenance of the website with the actual information for those who are searching for job in another country/city. To ensure a possibility at the website for maintaining the forum.
3. To develop information materials 'How to get safely employed in the Russian Federation', 'How to get safely employed in Ukraine'. Possible places for disseminating the information materials: civic organizations, boarder checkpoints, websites and social networking sites.
4. To develop recommendations on case management of victims of THB to ensure complex care services and to prevent re-trafficking for the purpose of exploitation.
5. To conduct training for social assistants on the issues: 'Needs assessment of victims of THB', 'Case management of victims of THB'.
6. To conduct training for psychologists of the organizations on the issue: 'Signs of abuse and the specific of counseling abuse survivors'.
7. To conduct training for lawyers of the organizations on the issue: 'Employment contract: the specific of signing and possible risks'.
8. To conduct training for male victims of THB on the issue: 'Behavior in risk situations and coping strategies to address them'.
9. To conduct training for the representatives of law enforcement bodies working in rural areas on 'Identification of victims of THB'.
10. To engage victims of THB into the information campaigns for peer informing.